

# Reply Made To Psychiatrist's Doubt

The noted psychiatrist, Dr. Carl J. Jung, stated in an article published in the November "Atlantic Monthly" magazine that God, the human soul, and other spiritual beings are mere inventions of a man's "unconscious" imagination. The following article is a reply to Dr. Jung.

By REV. DR. WILLIAM M. HART

Philosophy Professor at St. Bernard's Seminary

In the ordinary affairs of his life a man respects the various skills of his fellow-men and their differing competences.

No one calls a physician to repair a pipe. No one calls a plumber to cure a pain.

Why, then, is the world inclined to call a psychiatrist to cure a soul? Or better, why does the psychiatrist at times deem himself competent to speak the last word regarding the ultimate meaning of man, the devil, and God Himself?

THESE ARE reasons which account for but do not justify this interesting phenomenon. The trouble is that such nonsense as C. G. Jung has written in the November issue of the "Atlantic" magazine is not just an interesting phenomenon. It is a dangerous symptom of a world seeking answers from a source that cannot properly respond and of a scientist offering pseudo-solutions to problems which cannot be adequately handled by his method of inquiry.

Let me say here at the beginning that we recognize the distinction of Doctor Jung in the world of psychiatry. We are willing to concede in advance whatever genuine contributions he has made to the purely practical and empirical study of human psychology and mental illness.

We know further that many religious persons have tended, to admit him for the rather negative reason that he abandoned Freud's pansexualism and incorporated into his own theories a recognition of the religious features of the normal human existence.

WE UNDERSTAND also that psychiatrists have suffered unjustified attacks at times because their work has not been well understood. Harsh things have been said about them when someone has taken as a statement of ultimate philosophical and theological truth what the psychiatrist has intended only as a working theory of human behavior.

THE SCIENTISTS have often been in impatient disagreement with philosophers and theologians. It is time now to realize that there are good grounds for our impatient disagreement with Doctor Jung. We are in disagreement because the eminent psychiatrist has presumed to pronounce on matters concerning which he has no specialized knowledge.

We incline to impatience because such incompetent pronouncements reflect what appears to be a stubborn refusal to see any truth beyond the limits of the rather restricted view of empirical psychology.

To begin with, Doctor Jung has presumed to exhaust the entire meaning of faith, religious experience and God by an appeal to the unconscious in man. Beyond the unconscious, he says, there is nothing knowable to man; the unconscious is the end of the road in man's mental journey. To speak of a God beyond the subjective unconscious is to ask the cause of this experience of God, is, according to Jung, to involve oneself with the transcendental-unknown. Reasoning and



FATHER HART

argument to something or someone real above and beyond our present experience is worse than futile, for it is the search for an answer that... lies beyond the range of human knowledge.

Man's unconscious, so centrally important in Jung's theory, is a very strange and obscure element.

While this "unconscious" element is reported as an experimentally proved fact influencing the contents of consciousness, it is also practically immune to any actual examination, since Jung admits "... it is of uncertain extent and constitution, so that over- or under-evaluation of it is groundless and can be dismissed as mere prejudice."

Thus does the psychiatrist rule out arbitrarily and knowledge that is not derived from his own method and in accord with his own rather indefinite definition.

Fortunately, however, we know that there is more of knowledge, more of certitude, and surely more of wisdom to be found by man than is presented to him in the highly-artificial constructs of the psychiatrist.

Philosophy and theology still stand as rich and valid sciences despite their being ignored by some learned experts in empirical science.

All "rational" inquiry about religious experience, says Jung, leads man finally to the consciousness of the weakening of the Church and the precariousness of his own position. There follows upon this conscious reasoning in matters that belong exclusively to the unconscious insecurity, conflict, and ultimate disaster.

COMMON EXPERIENCE does not bear this out, however, because there are many who will testify that their very conscious and very rational studies in philosophy, history, and theology have led them not to any disturbing defensive conflict, but, on the contrary, to a tranquil and satisfying reassurance concerning the truth in religious matters.

The evil that is in man — at least potentially — is hardly realized by the Church, says

Jung. According to him, original sin, "... Adam's relatively innocent slip-up with Eve," as understood by the Church, is almost a euphemism, a gross under-estimation. Traditional religion, he says, simply does not grasp the enormity of the evil that is in the world and the capacity for evil that is in man; only the psychologists have true knowledge of this.

Though it is hard to admit, one is led to believe that Doctor Jung must be wholly unfamiliar with the genuine teaching of the Church regarding original sin and its effects.

The Church teaches that original sin is the cataclysmic moral defect of mankind in Adam. It leaves man deprived of the grace of God. It brings obscurity to his understanding. It results in weakness of will and an inclination to evil and

This recommendation is woefully weak and inept for the solution and cure of the world's ills.

Jung himself says that reason alone will not suffice in the guidance of human affairs. Neither will an empiric-psychological educational program be effective in the solving of mankind's problems.

No, Jung must not be so unscientifically precipitate in his grand diagnoses and suggested therapy. He must first rid himself of that kind of narrow-mindedness that is the constant occupational hazard for those who dedicate themselves too exclusively to the empirical sciences.

Jung must grow to appreciate that there are other superior instruments for the discovery of scientific truth.

Psychiatry, Jung must learn, has not just now found man out. The Church for twenty centuries has actively taught and warned all men of their weakness, their defects, their tendency to sin. What Jung's doctrine hints at and hints at, the Church has long since understood and defined in dogma. And her definitions are not in the dubious terms of "uncertain" extent and constitution.

IF THE NATURE of religious experience, religious thought, and original sin are so narrowly envisioned by Jung, we should not perhaps be surprised to hear him say that the Christian tradition and influence have become a stumbling block in the way of insight and the proper handling of the world's problem of evil.

We should, perhaps, be prepared for his short-sighted recommendation that the psychiatrist must take the lead in this new world of ours, that the psychologist must now re-assess man because he is about to lose the life-giving myth treasured up for him by Christianity, that the psychologist must by clear guidance make known to man his own inward unconscious with all its propensities to evil and destruction.

THEN HE WILL see that there are fully creditable scientific disciplines capable of bringing true and valid knowledge of God, man, and human destiny. Then he will see, too, how treacherous is the error of substituting a theoretical and superficial caricature of man resultant from some convenient working theory in a laboratory in place of the profound and authentic image of man seen in philosophy and theology.

And finally, in virtue of this new and broader vision Doctor Jung will see that psychiatry by its very nature can never say the last word about God, or the Devil, or the Human Soul.

For School, Lab., Sanitarium Fireproof 127-Room Bldg. 81 Acres This group of 3 main buildings on approx. 81 acres in Hornell, N.Y. is 65 miles from Rochester. 127-room brick main building, all fireproofed, was recently modernized at cost of over \$200,000. 701 bedrooms with running water. New natural gas heating plant. 50 x 100 concrete auditorium. Three 6-room houses. Reduced to \$80,000 for quick sale. Ask for illus. brochure. Box 128, Vaudreuil, Que. Canada.

## Scrantom's Plays Santa's Game!

**MONOPOLY** Parker Brothers' Trade-Mark Name for its Real Estate Trading Game. World's most popular game! Traders can make fortunes — or go bankrupt. White box Edition, removable bank tray. Grand Hotels stamped in gold. Double supply of "Money." New short game rules included. For from 3 to 10 players. \$4.00

**SORRY** Fun for the whole family. Skill and chance are equally combined in fast and exciting play. \$2.50

**CLUE** Adults, teenagers — everybody wants this great new detective game. Accessories include "plot" board, playing pieces, special Clue Cards. Every player has the thrill of being a real detective! For 3 to 6 players. \$3.00

**Scrantom's**  
334 E. Main St.  
Northgate Plaza      Culver-Ridge Plaza  
South Town Plaza  
I. I. Free Parking in Stillton St. Ramp with \$1 Purchases

## Legion Of Mary Program In Kansas

Kansas City — (NC) — Bishop John P. Cody of Kansas City-St. Joseph has asked for the establishment of the Legion of Mary in every parish in the diocese.

"The Legion is not an untried form of Catholic activity, but has in my own experience been the source of great spiritual progress and success, both for those who carry on the work of the legion as well as for those whom the legion has served," the Bishop said.

## Vermont Bishop Aids Penal Reform

Montpelier — (NC) — Bishop Robert F. Joyce of Burlington has been named by Gov. Joseph Johnson on a nine member advisory committee to study Vermont's penal and correctional system with a view to improving rehabilitation programs.

The group will advise and conduct with the National Probation and Parole Association, which the freedom of local communities will be completed by July 1.

## Pope Repeats Plea For Europe Unity

Vatican City — (NC) — Interrupting his annual Advent retreat, His Holiness Pope Pius XII received delegates of the third National Congress of the Italian Association for the Council of European Communities.

In a brief address the Pontiff praised the council's work and stressed the need for a political unification of Europe.

The council, he noted, is one of the most important movements for the unity of Europe. It can play a great part in the task of prompting governments toward achieving political and "supranational" federation of European states.

The task of the European communities in the federal unification of the old continent, he said, is that of helping to guarantee individual freedoms.

The Holy Father warned that tendencies toward centralization in modern nations greatly limit the freedom of local communities and individuals, and that there is a great need to call to the at-

## Austria Honors Author, Liturgist

Innsbruck — (NC) — The Republic of Austria has conferred one of its highest honors, the Silver Cross of Merit, on Father Joseph A. Jungmann, Jesuit theologian and world-renowned liturgy scholar.

The presentation was made here in the name of President Adolf Schaerf of Austria, at Canisianum College, of which Father Jungmann is rector, by Minister of Education Heinrich Drimmel.

A consultant to the Sacred Congregation of Rites, Father Jungmann is the author of "The Mass of the Roman Rite," which in its many translations has become a standard work in the field.

## American Nun Buried In Africa

Kampala, Uganda — (NC) — The body of Mother Kevin, foundress of the Missionary Franciscan Sisters of Africa, was buried on the grounds of the Little Sisters' motherhouse.

known to the natives among whom she worked, died last month in Boston, Mass. At the request of native Uganda chiefs and leading Catholics, her remains were flown to Uganda for burial on the continent where she worked for more than 50 years.

Keep CHRIST in YOUR CHRISTMAS!

Everyone is TALKING About the Huge Selections in

Rochester's Oldest and Largest Religious Goods Store

## Trant's Religious Gifts

THIS WEEK FEATURING Gifts of Statuary and Religious Pictures

### Religious Pictures! AND Imported DOMESTIC Statuary!

Beauty and Spiritual Inspirations in a Wide Selection

A beautiful Selection of all Subjects in a Variety of SIZE, colors and prices. Included are new 3 Dimensional creations in full color.

For Home, Church or School!

Trant's beautiful selection of imported and domestic Statuary. A joy to see. A precious gift to receive. All popular subjects. In all price ranges. See them, today!

Included are Beautiful Authentic Wood Carvings.

The Sacred Heart of Jesus

Come In Today!

## Christmas Cards

The Largest And Most Beautiful Selection Of Religious Cards In Rochester

**Trant's** THE CATHOLIC SUPPLY STORE  
2 ENTRANCES  
96 Clinton Ave. N. 115 Franklin St.  
Rochester, N. Y.  
Now Until Christmas 9:00 to 5:30 P.M. Tues. and Thurs. 'til 9 P.M.

Gifts in all Price Ranges at Trant's for Everyone on your List!

When ordering by mail, please include 3% Sales Tax if you are a resident of Monroe County

"It's a JUMBO value!"

A full quart of quality whiskey for the price of a fifth

only \$4.85 FULL QUART

25% more whiskey than a fifth

## Governor's Club

FINE SELECTED BLENDED WHISKEY

Central Springs #1, St. George's #2, Inc. Distillers, Philadelphia, Penna.  
No. 100, 25% Straight Whiskey & 75% More Old, Blended with 65% Grain